

The Distinctive Issues of Ahlul-Hadeeth

al-Allaamah al-Imaam Badee ud deen Shah
ar-Raashidee as-Sindhee (1416H)

(from a speech delivered in 1945ce in the presence of the reviver of Islaam, the great Allaamah,
the Imaam Abul-Wafa Thanullaah Amritsari)

**Khutbaat Raashidiyyah
Issues 7-11**

Trans: Abu Hibbaan & Abu Khuzaimah Ansaari

The Seventh (7) Issue Saying Ameen Loudly

Concerning this it was the norm of the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam),

“When he would finish from reciting the mother of the book (ie al-Faatihah) he would raise his voice and say Ameen.” (narrated by Daarqutnee (1/480 no.1259) and al-Haakim(1/345 no.816)

another hadeeth has been transmitted with a similar meaning in Abu Dawood (no.932) which Tirmidhee has graded Hasan and Abu Dawood remained silent after it and the Imaam would remain silent on those ahadeeth which according to him would constitute evidence.

So it is clear from both ahadeeth that from his example was that it is evidence he would say Ameen loudly and not silently. As for the hadeeth the hanafees use as evidence to say Ameen silently then that is not authentic at all as Shu’bah has erred in the hadeeth and instead of saying “he raised his voice” he said “he said it silently” and as for the hadeeth of Sufyaan we have presented, Imaam Bukhaari and Imaam Abu Zur’ah ar-Raazee have given it precedence over the hadeeth of Shu’bah (refer to Tirmidhee)

Also Imaam Daarqutnee has given this hadeeth precedence in his Sunan so we find the truth is what the madhab of the people of hadeeth was.

We will now mention a report and conclude this discussion hence Imaam Ibn Hibbaan in his book ath-Thiqaat has transmitted from Imaam Abu Haneefah's teacher A'taa bin Abee Raba'h with an authentic chain who said,

"I saw 200 companions of the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) in this masjid al-Haraam and when the Imaam would say Wa-Ladhaaleen (they would ie 200 companions) raise their voices and say Ameen."(Kitaab ath-Thiqaat (2/265), Baihaqee (2/59)

So there is constant amazement those people who do not act upon the Sunnah themselves and have hatred and jealousy for those who do act on the Sunnah and we find from the ahadeeth this trait is of the jews and does not benefit the Muslims. (refer to Sunan Ibn Maajah (no.856-857), Saheeh Ibn Khuzaimah (no's 574, 585), Musnad Ahmad (2/134-135), Baihaqee (2/56), Majma'a az-Zawaaid (2/115-116)

The Eighth (8) Issue Raising the Hands

Concerning this it is narrated in the 2 Saheehs by Ibn Umar that

"The Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) would raise his hands to his shoulders when he would begin his prayer, when he would say the takbeer for ruku and when he would raise his head from ruku and say Samee Allaahu Leeman Hamida Rabbana Wa Laqal Hamd and he would not do this whilst in prostration." (Bukhaari no's 735-737, Muslim (no's861-865), Abu Dawood (no's 255-256), Tirmidhee (no.255-256), Ibn Maajah (no.858)

The people of understanding and those whom Allaah has granted love for his Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) and in following and obeying him then this hadeeth alone is sufficient.

However it should be clear the ahadeeth for raising the hands have been transmitted via many chains to the extent that some imams for example Ibn Hazm (Muhalla 4/93), Suyootee (al-Azhaar al-Mutanaasirah Fil Akhbaar al-Mutawaatirah, (no.48) Mujaddid ud deen Fairozabaadee (Safar as-Sa'adah no.14) and others hold this hadeeth is mutawaatir and Haafidh Ibn Hajr Asqalaanee has mentioned in Fath ul-Baaree (2/149) from his teacher, Imaam A'raaqee that he enumerated how many companions narrated it and he numerated 25 and this poor person (ie Imaam Badee ud deen) was only able to numerate 20,

1. Abu Bakr as-Siddeqqe
2. Umar bin al-Khattaab
3. Alee bin Abee Taalib
4. Ibn Umar
5. Ibn Abbaas
6. Ibn az-Zubair
7. Abu Hurairah
8. Abu Moosaa al-Asha'aree
9. Abu Humaid as-Sa'adee
10. Muhammad bin Muslimah
11. Abu Sa'eed
12. Maalik ibn al-Huwraith
13. Wail ibn al-Hujr
14. Sahl ibn Sa'ad
15. Abu Qataadah
16. Anas ibn Maalik
17. Jaabir ibn Abdullaah
18. Baraa ibn A'azib
19. Umar Laithee
20. Mu'adh ibn Jabal

And Haafidh Zailaa'ee has transmitted a hadeeth from Imaam Baihaqee's Khilaafiyyaat the text of which establishes raising of the hands as a command of the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) as does the hadeeth of Maalik bin al-Huwraith.

This is why some Scholars of hadeeth for example Muhammad ibn Seereen, Humaidee, Awzaa'ee, Imaam Ahmad bin Hanbal, Imaam Ibn Khuzaimah and Imaam Ibn Hibbaan and others held that it was

obligatory (ie to raise the hands) and this is also the speakers (ie Imaam Badee ud deen's) position.

This is because a command is for something that is obligatory up until any evidence is not found. As for the hadeeth of Abdullah ibn Mas'ood then the scholars of hadeeth have said it is weak (refer to Juz Raf al-Yadain no's 11-15 of Imaam Bukhaari). The student of Imaam Abu Haneefah, the leader of the mujaahideen and pious ones Abdullaah ibn al-Mubaarak said concerning this hadeeth, "*The hadeeth of Ibn Mas'ood is not established*" (Refer to Sunan Tirmidhee).

As for the hadeeth of flapping the hands like the tail of a horse then that is concerning the salaam and has nothing to do with the raising of the hands refer to Juz Raf al-Yadain of Bukhaari and if this hadeeth was considered to be concerning raising the hands then there is no difference between the likening and that which is likened to and this statement of the Prophet becomes baseless an idle.

If one was to think then they would know that there is a big difference in raising of the hands and the moving of tails of horses, if however this was understood with regards to answering the Salaam then it can be understood and a distinction can be made between the likening and that what is likened to.

Furthermore if this is restricted to raising the hands at particular instances then this hadeeth opposes the madhab of the hanafees because they themselves raise their hands for the takbeers of Eed and for the qunoot in the witr prayer.

It was the principle of Abdullaah bin Umar (Raadhiallaahu Anhuma) as is narrated from him by Imaam Bukhaari in Juz Raf al-Yadain and Imaam Daarqutnee (with Ta'leeq al-Mughnee 1/392 no. 1105) in his Sunan that,

"When he would see a man not raising his hands when going into ruku and getting up from it then he would hit them with pebbles." (other than Daarqutnee, Imaam Ahmad and Ibn al-Jawzee in his Tahqeeq (1/332) have transmitted this)

And it is not feasible to think that Ibn Umar such an illustrious companion and Imaam would hit someone on the mere account of

them abandoning something that was only recommended and in fact this establishes the obligation of raising the hands according to him. So if there is punishment for abandoning something that is only recommended then his Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallams saying to the one who said, “I will not increase or decrease in this” that he was from the paradise has no meaning.

The Ninth (9) Issue

Tawarruk

Then concerning this a hadeeth has been transmitted in Bukhaari from Abu Humaid Saa’adee with the wording,

“and when he would sit after 2 rak’ahs he would sit on his left foot and keep his right foot upright and when he would sit in the last rak’ah he would spread his left foot and keep the other upright and sit on his leg.” (Bukhaari no.535)

And there are other ahadeeth (Saheeh Muslim no.579, Abu Dawood and Nasaa’ee), also but for the believers and those who care even one will suffice and for those who don’t care thousands will not benefit unlike the scholars of hadeeth who acted upon them as soon as seeing them.

It must be known the ahadeeth the Hanafiyyah present in abandoning the tawarruk then all of them are general and are not detailed and as for this hadeeth is it detailed hence it is worthy to be acted upon. Hence Maulana Abdul Hayy Lucknowee after bringing both general and detailed evidences in his Ta’leeq al-Mumajjad (no.13, Qadeemee Qutub Khan, Karachee) concludes,

“with justice there is no hadeeth which concludes clearly that one should sit on his left foot in the last rak’ah and the hadeeth of Abee Humaid is detailed and it will be limited to it, over the general.”

The Tenth (10) Issue

The Sitting of Rest (Jalsah Istarahah)

Concerning this is the hadeeth of Maalik ibn al-Huwraith in Bukhaari that,

“I saw the Prophet (Sallallahu Alayhee Wasallam) pray and after the odd rak’ahs he would not stand up right away up until he would pause for a short while.” (Bukhaari no.823)

And the Hanafiyyah answer this hadeeth and say this is limited to the prophets action in his later life, but I ask them do they allow their older people to do this from the men or women so that they can act upon the Sunnah because you have prohibited the youth from acting upon the Sunnah. If the hanafiyyah say this is a lie as this is not mentioned in any hanafee book of fiqh and if they say our books do not even allow older people then what is the benefit of these figurative explanations.

Nonetheless standing up straight away without pausing is a means of discomfort in comparison to sitting first and then standing up and it is obligatory on Muslims in general and in particular for the hanafees to act upon both ways to find out which way is more easier and hence they testify to our correct claim.

As for the ahadeeth they present for not pausing in resting then those from them that are authentic are not specific or clear and those that are specific and clear are not authentic and anyway accepting their evidences would deem the negation of the obligation the pause of sitting and not of it being Sunnah. Not accepting this is just according to the hadeeth, ***“Whoever dislikes my Sunnah then he is not from me.”*** (Bukhaari no.4776)

The Eleventh (11) Issue

Witr

In this issue there are differences at 2 instances, one in the number of rak’ahs(for witr) and 2 how it is performed. As for the first then the position of the hanafee is that witr is only 3 rak’ahs but according to the scholars of hadeeth one can increase or decrease from this and there is no harm in it because varying ahadeeth have been transmitted rather it is more better to pray 1 witr because most ahadeeth mention 1 witr (Saheeh Muslim no.1616, Abu Dawood 1336, Ibn Maajah no.1358, Saheeh Ibn Hibbaan no.678, Mustadrak al-Haakim 1/306)

From those ahadeeth is the following ahadeeth which has been transmitted in the 2 books of Saheeh where the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) said,

“Pray (the night pray) in 2 units and if anyone of you fears the morning (coming) then pray 1 rak’ah which make his pray number odd rak’ah” (Saheeh al-Bukhaari no.990)

no authentic hadeeth prohibits more or less that 3 rak’ah. As for the manner on how it should be performed then praying 1 rak’ahs or 5 is with the same method ie to recite the Tashahud in only the last rak’ah and say the salaam (Saheeh al-Bukhaari no.1137, Saheeh Muslim). As for 9 rak’ahs then the tashahud should be recited in the 8th rak’ah and then stand and in the 9th rak’ah recite tashahud again and say the salaam (refer to Mishkaat, Saheeh Muslim no.746) and for seven rak’ah both methods have been mentioned ie the method of 5 rak’ahs and 9 rak’ahs (refer to Sunan Nasaa’ee, Saheeh Muslim no.746)

as for 3 rak’ahs the hanafees say to pray like the maghrib prayer and the Ahlul hadeeth say praying 3 witr can be done in 2 ways, one is to pray 2 rak’ahs and say the salaam and then pray 1 rak’ah so that hadeeth pray in two’s can be acted on. There is a hadeeth in Saheeh Ibn Hibbaan (6/191 no.2435) which totally elucidates this with the following wording,

“The Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) would say Salaam in between he second and third rak’ah which we would hear.”

And the second method is like the 5 rak’ah method ie to pray 2 rak’ahs and not to recite the tashahud nor say the tasleem (but stand again and read the third rak’ah) and the hadeeth concerning the saying of the Salaam is in Nasaa’ee,

“He would not say the 2 tasleems in 3 rak’ahs” (Sunan Nasaa’ee (3/234), Daarqutnee no.175, Tahaawee no.1/280, Haakim 1/304, Baihaaqee 3/31 the chain is authentic)

and he would not sit because from the sitting in the middle rak'ah it would necessitate likening it to the maghrib prayer and this hadeeth prohibits it. (refer to Qiyaam al-Layl no.125 of Marwazee, Ibn Hibbaan no.680, Daarqutnee 2/24, Tahaawee no.177, Haakim 1/304 who authenticated it and Dhahabee agreed and Baihaqee and Daarqutnee said the narrators are trustworthy Haafidh said all the narrators are trustworthy, A'raaqee said the chain is authentic).

If someone says the qunoot is recited in the witr prayer and therefore there is no likening to the maghrib prayer then this will be answered that there are ahadeeth which prove the reading of qunoot in the maghrib prayer which again would liken the prayer.

If someone was to say a takbeer is also said for the qunoot in the witr prayer and his therefore would also liken the prayer then the answer to this is that this is a new innovation and there is no evidence from the one upon whom the sharee'ah was revealed and all innovations are misguidance.

The principle is there needs to be a differentiation between the maghrib and witr prayer by leaving the sitting (in the witr) hence it is narrated by Baihaqee from the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) that,

“When he would pray 3 witr he would not sit except in the last rak'ah”

so this is the recommended method and not the way the Hanafiyyah have understood.